

**HUMAN RIGHTS COMMISSION**  
**July 14, 2014**  
**5:30 P.M.**  
**2nd Floor County Committee Room**  
**Governmental Center, Traverse City, MI 49684**  
**Posted: 7/11/14**

Information and minutes are available from the Human Resources Office, Governmental Center, 400 Boardman, Traverse City, MI 49684 922-4481. TDD: 922-4412. If you are planning to attend and you have a disability requiring any special assistance at the meeting, please notify Human Resources, by noon of the above meeting date.

**AGENDA**

- 1. ROLL CALL**
- 2. APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES OF THE JUNE 9, 2014 REGULAR MEETING**
- 3. PUBLIC COMMENT**
- 4. OLD BUSINESS**
  - a. Discussion regarding the annual Educational Forum
- 5. NEW BUSINESS**
  - a. Discussion regarding the adoption of a Resolution in support of Indigineous Peoples Day
- 6. COMMISSIONER COMMENTS**
- 7. ADJOURNMENT**

Next regular meeting date: August 11, 2014 @ 5:30 p.m.  
Agenda Items (w/back up material) and Committee Chair Reports **MUST BE** submitted to Ex Officio, Jamie Caroffino (jcaroffino@traversecitymi.gov) no later than noon, Wednesday, August 6, 2014. Commissioner Packets to be emailed August 8, 2014.

The City of Traverse City does not discriminate on the basis of disability in the admission or access to, or treatment or employment in, its programs or activities. Penny Hill, Assistant City Manager, 400 Boardman Avenue, Traverse City, 49684, 922-4440 , TDD 922-4412, has been designated to coordinate compliance with non-discrimination requirements contained in section 35.107 of the Department of Justice regulations. Information concerning the Americans with Disabilities Act, and the rights provided thereunder, are available from the ADA Coordinator.

**MINUTES**  
**TRAVERSE CITY HUMAN RIGHTS COMMISSION**  
**REGULAR MEETING**  
**MONDAY, JUNE 9, 2014**  
**5:30 P.M.**  
**County Committee Room**  
**Governmental Center, 2nd Floor**  
**400 Boardman Avenue**  
**Traverse City, Michigan 49684**

**PRESENT:** Commissioners Gardner, Hornberger, McClellan, Mentzer, Nash, Nerone and Stinnet  
**ABSENT:** Commissioners Donick and Callison  
**STAFF PRESENT:** Kelli Schroeder

**1. APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES OF THE APRIL 14, 2014 REGULAR MEETING**

Motion by Commissioner Nash, seconded by Commissioner McClellan to approve the April 14, 2014 meeting minutes. Upon vote, motion carried 7-0.

**2. PUBLIC COMMENT**

Clifton Murie, Traverse City, addressed the Commission regarding Complaint #01-2014.

Angela Antwine, Traverse City, addressed the Commission regarding a proposal to change Columbus Day to Indigenous Peoples Day.

**3. OLD BUSINESS**

**a. Discussion regarding the annual Educational Forum.**

Commissioner Mentzer spoke regarding the status of the Educational Forum. The moderator and panelists have been selected, with the event scheduled for October 23, 2014 at Scholars Hall on the campus of NMC. The forum topic will be affordable housing.

Discussion.

**4. NEW BUSINESS**

**a. Discussion regarding the Embrace the Dream partnership**

The Commission discussed continuing the partnership with Embrace the Dream. Commissioner Stinnet will serve as the point of contact on behalf of the HRC.

**5. COMMISSIONER COMMENTS**

None.

**6. ADJOURNMENT**

The meeting adjourned at 6:14 p.m.

---

Kelli Schroeder, Secretary

---

Date



## The Traverse City Human Rights Commission

### A Resolution Recognizing the Second Monday of October as Indigenous Peoples Day

- Because, the City of Traverse City recognizes the annexation of Odaawa, Ojibwa, and other Indigenous nations who have lived upon this land since time immemorial and values the progress our society has accomplished through American Indian technology, thought, and culture; and
- Because, the City of Traverse City understands that in order to help close the equity gap, government entities, organizations and other public institutions should change their policies and practices to better reflect experiences of American Indian people and uplift our country's Indigenous roots, history, and contributions; and
- Because, the idea of Indigenous Peoples Day was first proposed in 1977 by a delegation of Native nations to the United Nations – sponsored International Conference on Discrimination Against Indigenous Populations in the Americas; and
- Because, in 1990 representatives from 120 Indigenous nations at the First Continental Conference on 500 Years of Indian Resistance unanimously passed a resolution to transform Columbus Day into an occasion to strengthen the process of continental unity and struggle towards liberation, and thereby use the occasion to reveal a more accurate historical record; and
- Because, the City of Traverse City has a strong history of over Eight decades of American Indian activism, which the City celebrates and honors; and
- Because the United States Federal Government recognizes Columbus Day on the second Monday of October, in accordance with the Federal holiday established in 1937; now, therefore, be it
- Resolved,** by the Human Rights Commission that the City of Traverse City shall recognize Indigenous Peoples Day on the second Monday of October; and, further be it
- Resolved,** that the City of Traverse City shall continue its efforts to promote the well-being and growth of the Traverse City American and Indigenous community; and further be it
- Resolved,** that Indigenous Peoples Day shall be used to reflect upon the ongoing struggles of Indigenous people on this land, and to celebrate the thriving culture and value that

that Odaawa, Ojibwe, and other Indigenous nations add to our city; and, further be it

**Resolved,** the City of Traverse City encourages other businesses, organizations and public entities to recognize Indigenous Peoples Day.

I hereby certify that the above resolution was adopted by the Traverse City Human Rights Commission at its regular meeting held July 14, 2014 in the County Committee Room, Governmental Center, 400 Boardman Avenue, Traverse City, Michigan 49684.

---

Theresa Gardner, Chair

Submitted public  
comment  
6/9/2014 HRC

Petition for resolution

Traverse City Commission

A RESOLUTION OF THE MAYOR AND CITY COUNCIL

Recognizing the Second Monday of October as Indigenous Peoples Day

To: Michael Estes, Jim Carruthers, Barbara Budros, Jeanine Easterday, Gary L. Howe,  
Ross Richardson, Tim Werner, Benjamin C. Marnette

Dear Commissioner,

We the undersigned come to you today to urge you to correct, possibly, the most insulting and maligned injustices in our history; the celebration of Columbus Day as a federally recognized holiday. We understand that it is not within the jurisdiction of this body to enact a federal resolution, however it has become the overwhelming will of the citizenry of the City of Traverse City and the surrounding areas to adopt a resolution to rename this day – Indigenous Peoples day.

We trust you will assist us in the passing of this resolution to avoid further disrespect and embarrassment.

Sincerely,

Angeline Ozhaashkwe Biik

Jesse Dittmer (Waawiyekamig)

Bree Adams

Timothy Grey

Randy Day

The City of Traverse City

A RESOLUTION OF THE MAYOR AND CITY COUNCIL

Recognizing the Second Monday of October as Indigenous Peoples Day

By: Michael Estes, Jim Carruthers, Barbara Budros, Jeanine Easterday, Gary L. Howe,  
Ross Richardson, Tim Werner

Whereas, the City of Traverse City recognizes the annexation of Oddawa, Ojibwe, and other Indigenous nations homelands for the building of our city, and knows Indigenous nations have lived upon this land since time immemorial and values the progress our society has accomplished through American Indian technology, thought, and culture, and

Whereas, the City of Traverse City understands that in order to help close the equity gap, government entities, organizations and other public institutions should change their policies and practices to better reflect the experiences of American Indian people and uplift our country's Indigenous roots, history, and contributions; and

Whereas, the idea of Indigenous Peoples Day was first proposed in 1977 by a delegation of Native nations to the United Nations-sponsored International Conference on Discrimination Against Indigenous Populations in the Americas; and

Whereas, in 1990 representatives from 120 Indigenous nations at the First Continental Conference on 500 Years of Indian Resistance unanimously passed a resolution to transform Columbus Day into an occasion to strengthen the process of continental unity and struggle towards liberation, and thereby use the occasion to reveal a more accurate historical record; and

Whereas, the City of Traverse City has a strong history of over Eight decades of American Indian activism, which the City celebrates and honors; and

Whereas, the United States federal government, the State of Michigan, and the City of Traverse City recognize Columbus Day on the second Monday of October, in accordance with the federal holiday established in 1937;

Now, Therefore, Be It Resolved by The City Council that the City of Traverse City shall recognize Indigenous Peoples Day on the second Monday in October.

Be It Further Resolved that the City of Traverse City shall continue its efforts to promote the well-being and growth of the Traverse City American Indian and Indigenous community.

Be It Further Resolved that Indigenous Peoples Day shall be used to reflect upon the ongoing struggles of Indigenous people on this land, and to celebrate the thriving culture and value that Oddawa, Ojibwe, and other Indigenous nations add to our city.

Be It Further Resolved, the City of Traverse City encourages other businesses, organizations and public entities to recognize Indigenous Peoples Day.

Passed by the City Council

Second Day of June A.D. 2014

---

**APPROVED:**

---

**Michael Estes, Mayor**

**ATTEST:**

---

**Benjamin C. Marennette, City Clerk**

## A timeline of events

15,000 B.C. Era (Stone Age) Hunter gatherer groups inhabit North America

12000 BC Migrants arrive in the United States of America via a land bridge from Siberia. Survivors helped to people the Americas.

9000 BC Clovis Culture (a prehistoric paleo indian culture named after artifacts found at found at Blackwater Draw, Clovis, New Mexico) begins

7500 BC Folsom Culture (A pale Indian culture named after artifacts found at Folsom, New Mexico that occupied much of central North America) begins

7500 BC Eastern Woodland Culture begins

4000 BC Copper culture begins along the Great Lakes

2000 BC Pecos Culture begins producing rock paintings

1700 BC Mound Builders culture begins. Mound builder culture existed in the Southeast and mid-west, especially the Ohio River Valley. The mound building people lived in sedentary villages and built monumental architecture in the form of huge earthen mounds. These mounds were used for burials and they were not temples but temples were often built on top of them, as were residences for the elites. Around 2,000 of them were built between Wisconsin & Florida. 300 to 500 of them were found in the Ohio Valley alone.

1100 BC Anasazi build cliff cities at Mesa Verde, Colorado

250 BC Bow and arrow weapon introduced

1000 AD Woodland Culture Period: Adena Culture, Hopewell culture. As the people became more sedentary there was the appearance of ceramics, long distance trade, more complex burial rituals, the construction of burial mounds, and the rise of agriculture.

1000A.D. Mississippian Culture established - Cahokia is the capital

1400 By the 1400's the continent of North America was densely populated with at least 20 million people, but possibly as many as 125 million indigenous people. They spoke over 1,000 different languages and had complex as well as nomadic tribes or societies.

1451 Christopher Columbus was born in Genoa.

1476 When Christopher Columbus was a young teen he became a sailor. A few years later he

has to swim ashore when his ship is sunk in a battle off Portugal.

1477 Christopher Columbus joined his brother Bartholomew in Lisbon to work as a cartographer

1480 Christopher Columbus begins his campaign to find funding for a voyage west. He believes that he can find a trade route into the Indies. More importantly he believes he can find Gold.

1484 Christopher Columbus fails to gain the funding from the King of Portugal for his voyage.

1485 Christopher Columbus moves to Cadiz, Spain and opens another shop that supplies maps and charts.

1486 Columbus petitions his plans to the Spanish court but is refused any patronage

1487 Columbus submits his plans to King Henry VII of England and King Charles VIII of France but again his proposals are declined.

1491 Columbus again appeals to King Ferdinand of Spain for patronage but he was refused again. A priest, Father Perez, intercedes on behalf of Christopher Columbus and pleads with Queen Isabella to fund Columbus. He emphasizes that he would be able to convert heathen races to Christianity

1492 Finally Christopher Columbus gets the news he has waited years to hear, King Ferdinand and Queen Isabella of Spain will act as patrons for Columbus providing money and ships for his voyage West.

August: He leaves Palos, Spain in search of the Indies on his ship which is called the Santa Maria. His son, Fernando accompanied Columbus. The other two ships were called the Pinta and the Nina. Martin Alonso Pinzon commanded the Pinta and his brother, Vicente Yanez Pinzon commanded the Nina. The three ships carried 120 men

September 8: The Voyages of Christopher Columbus on the Santa Maria, Nina and Pinta begin

October 12th 1492- Christopher Columbus discovers America (the island of San Salvador. He never actually steps a foot on any part of the North American continent)

He wrote in his journal about that first day-

"As I saw that they were very friendly to us, and perceived that they could be much more easily converted to our holy faith by gentle means than by force, I presented them with some red caps, and strings of beads to wear upon the neck, and many other trifles of small value, wherewith they were much delighted, and became wonderfully attached to us. Afterwards they came swimming to the boats,

bringing parrots, balls of cotton thread, javelins, and many other things which they exchanged for articles we gave them, such as glass beads, and hawk's bells; which trade was carried on with the utmost good will. But they seemed on the whole to me, to be a very poor people. They all go completely naked, even the women, though I saw but one girl. All whom I saw were young, not above thirty years of age, well made, with fine shapes and faces; their hair short, and coarse like that of a horse's tail, combed toward the forehead, except a small portion which they suffer to hang down behind, and never cut. Some paint themselves with black, which makes them appear like those of the Canaries, neither black nor white; others with white, others with red, and others with such colors as they can find. Some paint the face, and some the whole body; others only the eyes, and others the nose. Weapons they have none, nor are acquainted with them, for I showed them swords which they grasped by the blades, and cut themselves through ignorance. They have no iron, their javelins being without it, and nothing more than sticks, though some have fish-bones or other things at the ends. They are all of a good size and stature, and handsomely formed. I saw some with scars of wounds upon their bodies, and demanded by signs the of them; they answered me in the same way, that there came people from the other islands in the neighborhood who endeavored to make prisoners of them, and they defended themselves. I thought then, and still believe, that these were from the continent. It appears to me, that the people are ingenious, and would be good servants and I am of opinion that they would very readily become Christians, as they appear to have no religion. They very quickly learn such words as are spoken to them. If it please our Lord, I intend at my return to carry home six of them to your Highnesses, that they may learn our language. I saw no beasts in the island, nor any sort of animals except parrots." Columbus did indeed carry home some of the indigenous people, 20 of them. Only 7 remained alive by the time they reached Spain.

On day two of the first journey he wrote "I do not, however, see the necessity of fortifying the place, as the people here are simple in war-like matters, as your Highnesses will see by those seven which I have ordered to be taken and carried to Spain in order to learn our language and return, unless your Highnesses should choose to have them all transported to Castile, or held captive in the island. I could conquer the whole of them with fifty men, and govern them as I pleased. Near the islet I have mentioned were groves of trees, the most beautiful I have ever seen, with their foliage as verdant as we see in Castile in April and May. There were also many streams. After having taken a survey of these parts, I returned to the ship, and setting sail, discovered such a number of islands that I knew not which first to visit; the natives whom I had taken on board informed me by signs that there were so many of them that they could not be numbered; they repeated the names of more than a hundred. I determined to steer for the largest, which is about five leagues from San Salvador; the others were some at a greater, and some at a less distance from that island." proving that Columbus planned to enslave and conquer the indigenous people all along. His writing also help to create a visual as to how many indigenous people must have been there, and how capable they were. He describes the indigenous people as generous and curious and talks of them swimming up to the boats to Columbus' people water and other gifts.

After Columbus explored a few of the islands (Cuba on October 28th and Hispaniola on December 25th) Columbus made arrangement for 39 of his men to stay there and he returned to Spain a failure. Columbus hadn't found a route to the Indies, China or gold. He

had lost his biggest ship when they ran aground in Hispaniola. The silks and spices he had promised were replaced with a few trinkets and less than 10 hostages/slaves. He presented these people to the King and Queen and told them that he would return from his next voyage with as many slaves as they wanted and more gold than they could imagine.

1493 Columbus was sure his second voyage would be a success. He planned to colonize and explore the "new" land. He was given 17 ships and over 1,000 men. This voyage would be the first time European domesticated animals such as pigs, horses and cattle came to the "new" land. Columbus' orders were to expand the settlement on Hispaniola, convert the indigenous people to Christianity, establish a trading post and continue his explorations in search of China or Japan.

The ships set sail on October 13th, 1493 and first saw land on November 3rd. Upon returning to the island of Hispaniola, Columbus discovered that the men he had left behind on the first voyage had angered the native population by raping local women. The natives had attacked the settlement, killing every last European. Columbus, consulting his native chieftain ally Guacanagarí, laid the blame on Caonabo, a rival chief. Columbus and his men attacked, routing Caonabo and taking many of his people as slaves.

Columbus then took about two thousand local villagers, who had come out to greet them, captive. Miguel Cuneo (a member of Columbus' crew) wrote: "When our caravels were to leave for Spain, we gathered one thousand six hundred male and female persons of those Indians, and these we embarked in our caravels on February 17, 1495 For those who remained, we let it be known (to the Spaniards who manned the island's fort) in the vicinity that anyone who wanted to take some of them could do so, to the amount desired, which was done."

Cuneo further notes that he had taken beautiful young (teenaged) girl as his personal slave, a gift from Columbus himself, but that when he attempted to have sex with her, she "resisted with all her strength." So, in his own words, he "thrashed her mercilessly and raped her."

Columbus referred to the Indigenous people as cannibals. This was a story made up by him to help justify the murder, enslavement and genocide of these people. This story is still taught in some US schools today. He wrote to the Spanish monarchs in 1493: "It is possible, with the name of the Holy Trinity, to sell all the slaves which it is possible to sell here there are so many of these slaves, and also brazil wood, that although they are living things they are as good as gold"

Columbus and his men also used the Taino people as sex slaves. It was common place for one of Columbus' men to receive a "reward" in the form of a local young girl to rape. He began exporting Taino as slaves to other parts of the world, the sex-slave trade became an important part of the business, as Columbus wrote to a friend in 1500: "A hundred castellanoes (a Spanish coin) are as easily obtained for a woman as for a farm, and it is very general and there are plenty of dealers who go about looking for girls; those from nine to ten (years old) are now in demand."

The Taino were not particularly good workers in the plantations that the Spaniards and later the French established on Hispaniola. they resented their lands and children being taken, and attempted to fight back against the invaders. Since the Taino were obviously standing in the way of Spain's progress,

Columbus sought to impose discipline on them. For even a minor offense, a native's nose or ear was cut off, so he could go back to his village to and his people could see the brutality the Spanish were capable of. Columbus attacked them with dogs, skewered them with pikes, and shot them.

Life for the Taino became so unbearable that, as Pedro de Cordoba wrote to King Ferdinand in a 1517 letter, "As a result of the sufferings and hard labor they endured, the Indians choose and have chosen suicide. Occasionally a hundred have committed mass suicide. The women, exhausted by labor, have shunned conception and childbirth Many, when pregnant, have taken something to abort and have aborted. Others after delivery have killed their children with their own hands, so as not to leave them in such oppressive slavery."

Columbus and later his brother Bartholomew Columbus (who he left in charge of the island) simply resorted to wiping out the Taino altogether. Prior to Columbus' arrival, some place the population of Haiti/Hispaniola (now at 16 million) at around 1.5 to 3 million people. By 1496, it was down to 1.1 million, according to a census done by Bartholomew Columbus. By 1516, the indigenous population was 12,000, and according to Las Casas (who were there) by 1542 fewer than 200 indigenous people were alive. By 1555, every single one was dead.

This wasn't just the story of Hispaniola; the same has been done to indigenous peoples worldwide.

In May of 1493 Pope Alexander VI issued a papal bull granting official ownership of the new world to Ferdinand and Isabella. He declared "We of our own motion, and not at your solicitation, do give, concede, and assign for ever to you and your successors, all the islands, and main lands, discovered; and which may hereafter, be discovered, towards the west and south; whether they be situated towards India, or towards any other part whatsoever, and give you absolute power in them."

This declaration ultimately had dire consequences for the indigenous people. By 1514 the Spanish conquerors had adopted "the requirement". The Spaniards would often read this requirement without interpretation or from their ships before coming to collect slaves. translated the requirement is " I implore you to recognize the church as a lady and in the name of the pope take the King as lord of this land and obey his mandates. If you do not do it, I tell you that with the help of God I will enter powerfully against you all. I will make war everywhere and every way that I can. I will subject to the yolk and obedience to the Church and to his majesty. I will take your women and children and make them slaves.... The deaths and injuries that you will receive from here on will be your own fault and not that of his majesty nor of the gentlemen that accompany me"

When Columbus returned from his second journey he brought back many of the indigenous people as slaves. Columbus, who had once again promised gold and trade routes, did not want to return to Spain empty-handed. Queen Isabella, appalled, decreed that the New World natives were subjects of the Spanish crown and therefore could not be enslaved, although the practice continued. Most of Columbus' slaves were freed and ordered returned to the New World.

The second journey was considered a success because a settlement was founded.

1496            However, to Columbus' great disappointment Ferdinand and Isabella would not allow the taking of slaves in the new world. Columbus had planned to supplement the lack of gold with

money from selling slaves. The King and Queen funded the third journey so that Columbus could supply the new settlement and so he could continue to look for a route to the orient.

1498 Columbus and his men embarked on their third journey. In the roughly two years since Columbus had been gone, the settlement on Hispaniola had seen some rough times. Supplies and tempers were short and the vast wealth that Columbus had promised settlers while arranging the second voyage had failed to appear. Columbus had been a poor governor during his brief tenure (1494-1496) and the colonists were not happy to see him. The settlers complained bitterly, and Columbus hung a few of them in order to stabilize the situation. Realizing that he needed help governing the unruly and hungry settlers, Columbus sent to Spain for assistance. Responding to rumors of strife and poor governance on the part of Columbus and his brothers, the Spanish crown sent Francisco de Bobadilla to Hispaniola in 1500. Bobadilla was a nobleman and a knight of the Calatrava order, and he was given broad powers by the Spanish crown, superseding those of Columbus. The crown needed to rein in the unpredictable Columbus and his brothers, who in addition to being tyrannical governors were also suspected of improperly gathering wealth. Bobadilla arrived in August, 1500, with 500 men and a handful of native slaves that Columbus had brought to Spain on a previous voyage: they were to be freed by royal decree. Bobadilla found the situation as bad as he had heard. Columbus and Bobadilla clashed because there was little love for Columbus among the settlers, Bobadilla was able to clap him and his brothers in chains and throw them in a dungeon. In October, 1500, the three Columbus brothers were sent back to Spain, still in shackles. Columbus' Third Voyage was a fiasco. Back in Spain however, Columbus was able to talk his way out of trouble: he and his brothers were freed after spending only a few weeks in prison.

1502 In May Columbus set out on his fourth and final voyage to the New World. He carried on with the indigenous people as he had before. He had four ships and his mission was to explore uncharted areas to the west of the Caribbean, hopefully finding a passage west to the Orient. Columbus did explore parts of southern Central America, but his ships, damaged by a hurricane and termites, fell apart while he was exploring. Columbus and his men were stranded on Jamaica for about a year before being rescued. His trip was a failure by any standards and when they returned to Spain in late 1504 Columbus discovered Queen Isabel was dying. Without her funding Columbus would never return to the New World.

1506 Christopher Columbus Dies

1500's The indigenous people were held as slaves, their young daughters were sold (or offered up) as sex slaves, and many were murdered simply for their land. That coupled with the Europeans bringing diseases such as typhoid, yellow fever, smallpox, measles and influenza to the indigenous population made their population decline dramatically.

Their numbers fell from 80 million to less than 1 million in less than 500 years.

## Organizations in support of the resolution

- Idle No More Michigan
- Idle no More
- Idle No More Minnesota
- MiCats (Michigan Coalition Against Tar Sands)
- D Cats (Detroit Coalition Against Tar Sands)
- Occupy Traverse City
- Occupy Kalamazoo
- Idle No More Indigenous Report
- Idle No More Detroit
- Occupy Racism
- Native Voices united USA / Canada
- Occupy Detroit

Thank you for standing with us make this right!